

Committee(s):	Date:
Planning & Transportation Committee- For Information	29 th January 2018
Subject: Planning Appeal Decisions	Public
Report of: The City Planning Officer- Annie Hampson	For Information
Report author: Neel Devlia – DBE- Planning	

Summary

The purpose of this report is to advise the Committee about the decisions made by the Planning Inspectorate on appeals made against the decisions of the City Corporation since the last such report to this Committee on 5th July 2016.

Recommendation(s)

I recommend that the contents of this report be noted.

Main Report

Background

1. This report is to notify your Committee of the outcomes of appeals made to the Planning Inspectorate between 16th June 2016 and 31st December 2017.

Current Position

2. Since June 2016 The Planning Inspectorate has issued decisions for:
 - two (2) appeals against the refusal of planning applications (one (1) allowed, one (1) dismissed)
 - one (1) appeal against the non-determination of a listed building consent application (allowed)
 - nineteen (19) appeals against the refusal of advertisement consent applications (seven (6) allowed, thirteen (13) dismissed)
 - one (1) appeal against the non-determination of an advertisement consent application (allowed)
 - ten (10) appeals against the refusal of applications for determination whether prior approval is required (one (1) allowed, nine (9) dismissed)

3. The tables below summarise the applications which have gone to appeal and the Planning Inspectorate's (PINs) decisions.

Application number	15/01319/FULL
Address	191 Fleet Street, London, EC4A 2NJ
Proposal	Retention of shopfront.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 24.02.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Refused by Planning and Transportation Committee because the installed shopfront detracts from the appearance of the building and thereby the character and appearance of the Fleet Street Conservation Area and the setting of nearby listed buildings. The Inspector took the view that the shopfront is out of keeping with the building and adversely affects its character and appearance and, as a result, the character, appearance and significance of the Conservation Area. The unsympathetic shopfront has an adverse impact on the setting of nearby listed buildings. The harm that has been caused by the shopfront to the significance of the Conservation Area as a whole and to the setting of nearby listed buildings is less than substantial, and must be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal. The Inspector concluded that the public benefits of the shopfront do not outweigh the harm caused to the Fleet Street Conservation Area and the setting of nearby listed buildings.

Application number	16/00632/FULL
Address	Flat 17, The Gallery, 38 Ludgate Hill, London, EC4M 7DE
Proposal	Installation of two air conditioning units at sixth floor.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 01.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Refused by Planning and Transportation Committee because the air conditioning units could give rise to an increase in background noise levels resulting in a loss of amenity for nearby residents contrary to Local Plan Policy DM 15.7. The Inspector took the view the proposal would not cause harm to the living conditions of the occupiers of neighbouring flats, and that it would not harm the heritage significance of the listed

	building, the setting of adjacent listed buildings or the character or appearance of the conservation area.
--	---

Application number	16/00633/LBC
Address	Flat 17, The Gallery, 38 Ludgate Hill, London, EC4M 7DE
Proposal	Installation of two air conditioning units at sixth floor.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Non-Determination 01.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	The application for Listed Building Consent was not determined by the Planning and Transportation Committee in this case on the basis that it could not precede without the associated planning permission. The Inspector took the view that the air conditioning units would not harm the heritage significance of the listed building.

Application number	16/00154/ADVT
Address	Outside Bacchus, 47 Farringdon Street, London, EC4A 4LL
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 47 Farringdon Street.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 26.09.2016
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00153/ADVT
Address	Outside 14 Farringdon Street, London, EC4A 4AB
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 14 Farringdon Street.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 26.09.2016
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed

Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.
----------------	--

Application number	16/00155/ADVT
Address	Outside St Andrews Church, 5 St Andrew Street, London EC4A 3AF
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside St Andrews Church Lodge.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 29.09.2016
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00152/ADVT
Address	Outside 65 Holborn Viaduct, London, EC1A 2FD
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 65 Holborn Viaduct.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 30.09.2016
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00254/ADVT
Address	Bus Stop Outside 57 - 60 Aldgate High Street, London, EC3N 1AL
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 57-60 Aldgate High Street.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Considered by Officers to be contrary to the City's policy on advertisements. The Inspector concluded that the proposed advertisement would reflect the character of the street scene

	and would not cause harm to the significance of the listed building; it would not be so obtrusive or predominant in this particular location that it would undermine the restrained and dignified character of the City; and it would not be a danger to highway users. The level of illumination has been limited by condition. Animated, flashing, scrolling, intermittent or video elements are not permitted.
--	---

Application number	16/00157/ADVT
Address	Bus Stop Outside Fleet Place House, London, EC4M 7RF
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside Fleet Place House.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Considered by Officers to be contrary to the City's policy on advertisements. The Inspector concluded that the proposed advertisement would not be prominent in views from the conservation area or harm the significance of listing buildings; it would not be so obtrusive or predominant in this particular location that it would undermine the restrained and dignified character of the City; and it would not be a danger to highway users. The level of illumination has been limited by condition. Animated, flashing, scrolling, intermittent or video elements are not permitted.

Application number	16/00156/ADVT
Address	Bus Stop On Northern Side of Newgate Street Outside Christchurch Greyfriars Churchyard, London, EC1A 1HQ
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside Atlantic House, 100 Newgate Street.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00258/ADVT
Address	6 Bishopsgate, London, EC2N 4DA
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 6 Bishopsgate.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Considered by Officers to be contrary to the City's policy on advertisements. The Inspector concluded that the proposed advertisement would not be prominent in views from the conservation area or harm the significance of listing buildings; it would not be so obtrusive or predominant in this particular location that it would undermine the restrained and dignified character of the City; and it would not be a danger to highway users. The level of illumination has been limited by condition. Animated, flashing, scrolling, intermittent or video elements are not permitted.

Application number	16/00257/ADVT
Address	Bus Stop O/S 186-190 Bishopsgate, London, EC2M 4NR
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 186-192 Bishopsgate.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Considered by Officers to be contrary to the City's policy on advertisements. The Inspector concluded that the proposed advertisement would preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area and would not harm the significance of the listed building; it would not be so obtrusive or predominant in this particular location that it would undermine the restrained and dignified character of the City; and it would not be a danger to highway users. The level of illumination has been limited by condition. Animated, flashing, scrolling, intermittent or video elements are not permitted.

Application number Address	16/00151/ADVT Bus Shelter Outside Atlantic House, 50 Holborn Viaduct, London, EC1A 2FG
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside Atlantic House, 50 Holborn Viaduct.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Considered by Officers to be contrary to the City's policy on advertisements. The Inspector concluded that the proposed advertisement would not be prominent in views from the conservation areas or harm the significance of listing buildings; it would not be so obtrusive or predominant in this particular location that it would undermine the restrained and dignified character of the City; and it would not be a danger to highway users. The level of illumination has been limited by condition. Animated, flashing, scrolling, intermittent or video elements are not permitted.

Application number Address	16/00261/ADVT Bus Stop Outside Plantation Place, 30 Fenchurch Street, London, EC3M 3BD
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside Plantation Place, 30 Fenchurch Street.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number Address	16/00262/ADVT Bus Stop Outside 143 - 171 Moorgate, London, EC2M 6XQ
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 143-171 Moorgate.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017

Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00260/ADVT
Address	158 Bishopsgate, London, EC2M 4LX
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 158 Bishopsgate.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00256/ADVT
Address	99 Bishopsgate, London, EC2M 3XF
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside 99 Bishopsgate.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	Considered by Officers to be contrary to the City's policy on advertisements. The Inspector concluded that the proposed advertisement would not be prominent in views from the conservation areas or harm the significance of listing buildings; it would not be so obtrusive or predominant in this particular location that it would undermine the restrained and dignified character of the City; and it would not be a danger to highway users. The level of illumination has been limited by condition. Animated, flashing, scrolling, intermittent or video elements are not permitted.

Application number	16/00457/ADVT
Address	Bus Shelter Outside Inner Temple Garden, North Side of Victoria Embankment, London, EC4Y 7EN
Proposal	Internally illuminated advertisement measuring 2.37m high by 1.34m wide by 0.35m deep on bus shelter outside Inner

	Temple Garden, north side of Victoria Embankment.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 25.05.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	17/00521/ADVT
Address	Pavement Outside, 1 - 5 St Botolph Street, London, EC3A 7AR
Proposal	Installation and display of an internally illuminated advertisement display panel on an existing telephone kiosk measuring 1.87m in height x 1.33m in width at a height of 0.57m above ground level.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 18.10.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00763/ADVT
Address	Retail Unit, 42 - 44 Bishopsgate, London, EC2N 4AH
Proposal	Installation and display of an externally illuminated advertisement hoarding measuring 9m high by 6m wide, displayed at a height of 8m above ground floor level.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 19.10.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	17/00522/ADVT
Address	81 Farringdon Street, London, EC4A 4BL
Proposal	Installation and display of an internally illuminated advertisement display panel on an existing telephone kiosk measuring 1.87m in height x 1.33m in width at a height of 0.57m above ground level.

Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 19.10.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	16/00327/ADVT
Address	16 Ludgate Hill, London, EC4M 7DR
Proposal	Installation and display of four signs with internally illuminated advertisements measuring 0.45m high by 5.0m wide, displayed at a height of 2.8m above ground floor level. Installation of replacement signs on the three existing projecting brackets, with advertisements measuring 200mm high by 600 mm wide displayed at a height of 2.6m above ground floor level.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 08.12.2016
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Contrary to the City's policy on advertisements.

Application number	15/01320/ADVT
Address	191 Fleet Street, London, EC4A 2NJ
Proposal	Retention of 70mm lettering to glazing.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Non-Determination 24.02.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed
Comment	The Inspector concluded that the sign does not harm visual amenity.

Application number	17/00397/DPAR
Address	Pavement Outside, 65 Fenchurch Street, London, EC3M 4BE
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.

Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 08.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number Address	17/00396/DPAR Pavement Outside, 30 Fenchurch Street, London, EC3M 3BD
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 08.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number Address	17/00407/DPAR Pavement Outside 155 Bishopsgate, London, EC2M 3TQ
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 12.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number	17/00403/DPAR
Address	Pavement Outside 222 Bishopsgate, London, EC2M 4QD
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 12.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding heritage and townscape.

Application number	17/00406/DPAR
Address	Pavement Outside Heron Tower, 110 Bishopsgate, London
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 12.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number	17/00402/DPAR
Address	Pavement Outside East Side of Aldgate House, 33 Aldgate High Street, London, EC3N 1AH
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 13.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Allowed

Comment	Considered by Officers to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets. The appeals on Aldgate and Aldgate High Street were dealt with under one decision. The Inspector concluded that the other appeal sites are surrounded by visual clutter and these phone kiosks would add to the visual clutter and cause harm. This site is comparatively free of clutter and the phone kiosk would subsequently not cause visual harm. The proposed phone kiosk would not harm pedestrian or highway safety.
----------------	--

Application number Address	17/00401/DPAR Pavement Outside Aldgate House, 33 Aldgate High Street, London, EC3N 1AH
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 13.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number Address	17/00400/DPAR Pavement Outside Aldgate Underground Station, Aldgate High Street, London, EC3N 1AH
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 13.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number Address	17/00399/DPAR Pavement Outside 77 Aldgate High Street, London, EC3N 1BD
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 13.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

Application number Address	17/00398/DPAR Pavement Outside 1 Aldgate, London, EC3N 1RE
Proposal	Application for determination under part 16 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) whether prior approval is required for the installation of a telephone kiosk.
Appeal Type	Appeal Against Refusal 13.12.2017
Appeal decision	Appeal Dismissed
Comment	Considered to be of unacceptable design and size, would cause obstruction to pedestrian movement and would detract from surrounding townscape and heritage assets.

If Members wish to see any of the decisions in detail they can be found online at www.planning2.cityoflondon.gov.uk (under the relevant application number) or could be made available to them.

Conclusion

4. Your Committee is recommended to note the contents of this report.

Contact:

Elisabeth Hannah
Chief Planning Administrator
0207 332 1725
elisabeth.hannah@cityoflondon.gov.uk